John S. Bradfield Public School  
Peer Review Summary

As requested by the Town Council of Highland Park at their April 9, 2018 meeting, representatives of HPISD’s architectural firm submitted documents for the design of the new John S. Bradfield Elementary School to Mr. Russell Windham of Curtis & Windham for a peer review. Appropriate elevations, floor plans, and axonometric views of the building were forwarded to Russell Windham and initial comments were received back from Mr. Windham on April 16, 2018. After receipt of these comments and mark-ups, a meeting with Mr. Windham and three representatives of Stantec Architecture was held on April 18, 2018 at Highland Park Town Hall to review the comments and work collaboratively on generating options based on these comments. The following is a recap of the ideas discussed and possible revisions to the design. While these are delineated by building area in these notes for clarity, the conversation was a holistic approach to the building.

**Classroom Area**

In an attempt to address the appearance of height of this three-story portion of the building, the following options were discussed.

- The first involved a change in material on the façade from a point approximately 40' Above Finish Floor. The building as currently designed uses brick up to this point, then corbels the brick above the third floor windows out to a projected ledge and uses Portland Cement Plaster from that point to the top of wall. The suggestion has been made to continue with brick for this portion of the wall as well, in lieu of changing to plaster.

- The second idea proposed was raising the height of the above-mentioned brick corbel and ledge from directly above the window height to approximately 16” higher.

- Another idea discussed was modifying the brick relief panels framing the first and second floor windows and the mullion design of the classroom windows. Essentially, the brick between windows on first and second is currently designed as a recessed panel in order to provide relief. The proposed revision would extend this relief panel to a point above the second floor windows as illustrated on Attachment 1. As an alternative to this modification of the brick panel, it was briefly discussed that stone panels similar to those on the original portion of the existing building might be utilized between the first and second floor windows if financially feasible.

- Additionally, after reviewing several different patterns of window division, it was proposed to revise the window pattern as illustrated in Attachment 1. This would translate to providing windows with a low horizontal divider on the ground floor, simpler vertical windows for the second, and windows with high horizontal dividers on the third floor.
Entry Area

There were several ideas discussed in this area.

- The first suggestion was revising the exterior material of the area above the front door to plaster in lieu of brick. *After further discussions/ sketches after this initial meeting, it was suggested that this area could remain brick as originally designed and slight ornamentation accomplished with the brick work.

- Also suggested was the revision of the high windows above the atrium to ornamentation, possibly a quatrefoil element or a grouping of these elements.

- A revision to the large windows in the atrium was discussed as well. It was generally agreed that these windows could be grouped together and revisions made to their shape and proportion from the purely rectangular windows originally designed. Along with this, a more detailed stone header and sill could be introduced for this window grouping. These suggestions are illustrated on Attachment 2 below.
**Administration/Library Area**

This portion to the right of the main entry (when facing the building) was the subject of much discussion during the review. The following suggestions were made:

- The tower element, which was designed as a plaster façade with stone ornamentation could be revised to brick. Additionally, the more elaborate ornamentation which makes up the tower top could be simplified with a simpler sloped roof, using decorative clay tile. Additionally, the suggestion was made that a portion of parapet directly adjacent to this tower be raised to provide symmetry with another portion of parapet across the entry area. The parapet being raised also meant raising the height of the body of the tower element in order to allow it to terminate into the tower walls.

- In order to clarify the overall massing elements of the building, the suggestion was made to move forward the south wall of the Administration area. This was suggested as perhaps as much as 2’, but no more than that. Additionally, it was suggested for aesthetic purposes to move the south wall of the Library (which is above the Administration area) out to align with the south wall of the Administration (first floor). This would have the effect of increasing the mass of the building along Southern Avenue but also adding to the library. These two exterior walls as currently designed are offset by approximately 8’, with the second floor stepped back from the exterior face of the first floor. In the original design, this offset between the upper floor exterior wall and the lower floor exterior wall is capped with clay tile roof which also continued to the colonnade across the entry court. The effect of proposal here was to essentially increase the size of the second floor and move the newly aligned walls out slightly.

- The windows which are on the southern elevation of the above-mentioned Library and Administration were also considered. The suggestion was made to simplify the form of the lower level windows to a rectangular form and pattern as adopted on the classroom area discussed previously above.

- A final suggestion made was to delete the entry colonnade in its entirety as a possible cost saving measure.

The cumulative effect of each of these possible revisions is reflected below in Attachment 3.
At the conclusion of this meeting, the representatives of Stantec created the revised images above in order to document the discussion and to allow the district’s contractor to formulate both potential costs and schedule implications associated with each. Those costs have been provided in a separate attachment.

**Final Revised Design**

After consideration of the options discussed as well as their associated financial and potential construction timeline impact, Highland Park I.S.D. has revised the design of the John S. Bradfield Elementary School as follows.

**Classroom Area**

- The height of the above-mentioned brick corbel and ledge which were originally designed to be located directly above the third-floor windows will be raised 16” higher as suggested.

- Additionally, the brick relief panels between the first and second floor windows will be modified/extended as suggested. The window muntins will be modified as suggested. The cast stone will be removed from the second floor window head conditions. At select locations bordering the student entry doors, it is proposed to install cast stone panels between the first and second floor windows, in a manner similar that of the current building.

**Entry Area**

- In light of the explorations by both Mr. Windham and Stantec involving modifying this area from brick to plaster, it has been decided to retain the originally designed brick and add pilasters.

- The Atrium windows will be grouped together and revisions made to their shape and proportion from the purely rectangular windows originally designed.
with this, a more detailed stone header and sill will be introduced for this window grouping.

- Also as suggested, the high windows above the atrium are being deleted and replaced with quatrefoil ornamentation.

**Administration/ Library Area**

- The tower element, which was designed as a plaster façade with stone ornamentation will be revised to brick as suggested. The height of the tower and the ornamentation will remain as originally designed.

- In order to address the concern regarding clarifying the overall massing elements of the building, an alternative solution has been designed. This solution does not involve adding square footage to the building by shifting the exterior walls of the administration and library areas. In this solution, the colonnade roof will extend only across the courtyard entry. The area of the administration area which originally was designed to have clay tile roofing will now be trimmed with brick pilasters and ornamental railing above, visually extending the currently designed balcony on the west side of the library. A short portion of this southern building façade will be projected out by masonry detailing, allowing a visual separation of the Gym from the Administration area. For this portion of the elevation, the parapet line will also be adjusted and a quatrefoil ornament introduced.

- The colonnade has been retained but has been significantly shortened in length as mentioned above.

- The gymnasium windows have been adjusted in pattern from their originally designed location. They have been designed now to be spaced more evenly across the Gym façade, they have been lowered, and cast stone headers have been added in a similar style to those above the Library windows. Additionally, a brick recess pattern will be introduced which is based upon a similar language which exists on the current Bradfield Gymnasium.

- As suggested, the lower windows in the Administration area will be simplified, replacing the arch top windows originally designed with rectangular windows similar to those in the Classroom area. The windows for the Library above have also been given simplified cast stone ornamentation. A simple brick relief panel has been introduced above the first floor windows. These elements have been suggested in sketches provided by Mr. Windham as well.

The result of the changes is illustrated below, compared to the original design.
In total, the changes accepted by Highland Park I.S.D. and illustrated above have been priced at approximately $399,000. Proceeding with these changes would be based upon the assumption that HPISD would fund the first $200,000 and the Town of Highland Park would provide funding for the remainder of the cost, up to $200,000. If the Town is unable to provide the funding, the district will reduce the scope of changes to work totaling $200,000.

If additional funding over and above the terms above were to be made available, Highland Park I.S.D. would be amenable to changing the material of the parapet at the Classroom area from plaster to masonry. This is Item 1 on the estimate spreadsheet. The cost for this would be an additional $228,600 since the district has already agreed to shift the corbel ledge upward, which accounts for $26,000.

After significant consideration, the remaining suggested changes to the project design have been declined by the school district. This includes removing the colonnade, revising the tower design, and adding square footage to the administration area and library by shifting those spaces outward toward Southern Avenue, for the following reasons:

• The colonnade is a design feature that both enhances the aesthetics of the front entry and provides shade and rain protection for both students and parents.

• The original tower design incorporates elements that are consistent with Highland Park Village next door to the school.

• It is not necessary to add square footage to the administration area and library. Doing so would not only add significant construction costs but would also likely keep the building from being completed on time. In addition, it would increase the 2nd floor mass toward neighbors along Southern Avenue and add unnecessary utility costs over the life of the building.